YOUTH PARLIAMENT PAKISTAN

7th YOUTH PARLIAMENT PAKISTAN

Youth Standing Committee on Political & Electoral System

Report: Is Pakistan more suited to adopt the Proportional Representation (PR) Electoral System versus the First-Past-The-Post (FPTP) Electoral System: Rationale & Proposals

February 2016

PILDAT
Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency
Secretariat Youth Parliament Pakistan

YOUTH PARLIAMENT PAKISTAN

7th YOUTH PARLIAMENT PAKISTAN

Youth Standing Committee on Political & Electoral System

Report: Is Pakistan more suited to adopt the Proportional Representation (PR) Electoral System versus the First-Past-The-Post (FPTP) Electoral System: Rationale & Proposals

February 2016

PILDAT
Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency
Secretariat Youth Parliament Pakistan

PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan. It also serves as Secretariat, Youth Parliament Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: February 2016

ISBN: 978-969-558-609-9

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.

YOUTH
PARLIAMENT
PAKISTAN

Secretariat, Youth Parliament Pakistan
Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@youthparliament.pk | Website: www.youthparliament.pk

CONTENTS

Preface
Acknowledgments

First Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan 11
Introduction 11
What is FPTP system? 11
Draft Policy Recommendations 11
Rationale behind the Recommendations 11
Rationale Behind FPTP System 12

Second Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan 13
Introduction 13
What is FPTP system? 13
What is PR system? 13
Ethno-political set up of Pakistan, viability of the PR Electoral System and unsuitability of the FPTP 13
Population Make-up 13
Religious and sectarian make up of Pakistan 13
Political make up of Pakistan 14
Viability of PR system in an intricately diversified Pakistan 14
Rationale behind adopting the PR system 14
Pre-Election Procedure (Recommendations to improve the PR system) 14
Policy Recommendations (To remove the flaws of the PR system, in order to make it more suitable) 14
Rationale behind the Recommendations 15

Third Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan 16
Introduction 16
What is FPTP? 16
What is PR? 16
Dynamics of Political Setup in Pakistan 16
Rationale 16
Recommendation 16

Fourth Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan 17
Introduction 17
Unique Ethno-Political societal make-up of Pakistan 17
Ethnic Diversity 17
Religious Diversity 17
Political Parties 17
First Past the Post system 18

Proportional Representation System 18
First Past the Post: Pros and Cons 18
Arguments in favour 18
Arguments Against 18
Proportional Representation System: Pros and Cons 18
Arguments in favour 18
Arguments Against 18
Recommendations 18
Immediate Measures 19
Middle Term Measures 19
Long Term Measures 19

Rationale for the Recommendations 19
Immediate Measures 19
Middle Term Measures 19
Long Term Measures 20
20

PREFACE

After the successful completion of 6 terms since 2007, the 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan was launched in July 2015.

The specific objectives of the Youth Parliament Pakistan (YPP) programme are to inculcate democratic culture and spirit of tolerance for others views among the youth; to expose them to the political and parliamentary processes; to facilitate youth to express their views on various national, international, regional and local issues thereby helping the government and society at large to better understand the concerns of the youth; to groom the leadership potential of the youth of Pakistan by exposing them to peaceful and democratic resolution of differences especially at a time when various parts of Pakistan are suffering from conflict and extremism. Finally YPP provides a forum to the youth of Pakistan to understand how the Parliament works as the supreme public representative institution in a democracy.

The 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan, under a revised model, managed to enroll 240 young people from all over Pakistan. 4 Sessions were held, these 24 members were divided in to 4 section consisting of 60 members each in which 60 new Members participated in 5-day training programme.

Youth Standing Committees of the 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan were tasked to develop cogent policy alternatives for the Parliament and Government of Pakistan. Each Committee was assigned a particular policy area and the Committees managed to develop a set concise policy recommendations in the shape of a Report. Each Committee presented and defended the Report to a Panel of Experts. The 4 Standing Committees for the current term are:

1. **Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations**
2. **Youth Standing Committee on Finance**
3. **Youth Standing Committee on Political and Electoral System**
4. **Youth Standing Committee on Governance**

Report topics given to each of the respective Youth Standing Committee were:

1. Pakistan's National Action Plan (December 2014): What is the State of its Implementation and Possible Proposals for Effective Implementation & Oversight.
2. Pakistan's Extended Fund Facility (EFF) Plan with the IMF and its Short-Term and Long-Term Economic Impact on Pakistan.
3. Is Pakistan more suited to adopt the Proportional Representation (PR) Electoral System versus the First-Past-The-Post (FPTP) Electoral System: Rationale & Proposals
4. What are the best international models for measuring Quality of Governance and why?

The Committees have gone through a process of intensive research, consultations with policy experts and internal review within Committees before putting together their proposals. The initial findings were shared before the House in Youth Parliament and with the Secretariat Youth Parliament Pakistan who gave their comments on these drafts. After incorporating these inputs, the reports are finalised by individual Committees. Going through this rigour the participants not only experienced the process of drafting policy in a democratic fashion but also formulated useful recommendation in the form of this report.

The reports are compiled and finally published for the purpose of dissemination. The reports are also available online at www.youthparliament.pk

The 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan (2015) is supported by the Danish International Development Agency, Government of Denmark, as recognition of the importance of young people's development in democracy and democratic practices.

Disclaimer

The Secretariat of Youth Parliament Pakistan has provided unbiased feedback in a timely manner on the research reports and the scientific value of the work done by MYP's. The Secretariat has given guidance in ensuring the content is clear, concise, and relevant to the current pool of knowledge in regard to originality, and interest to the readers. The opinions, findings or recommendations expressed in this report belong to the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of PILDAT, Youth Parliament Pakistan Secretariat or DANIDA.

Secretariat of the Youth Parliament Pakistan
February 2016

Acknowledgments

This research report is a sincere composition and hard work of many intellectual minds who have given thoughtful recommendations and analysis on Electoral Reforms in Pakistan.

We, the Chairpersons for (PILDAT) Youth Parliament Pakistan's Standing Committee on Electoral and Political System, would like to thank all our Committee Members who made these reports possible with their ideas and planning. Our appreciations go to our colleagues in developing the report with the best of their knowledge.

We are highly indebted to President PILDAT **Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob** and Joint Director **Ms. Aasiya Riaz** for their guidance and constant supervision as well as providing necessary information regarding the project and for their support in completing the report.

We would also like to thank **Ms. Aimen Khan**, Projects Manager PILDAT, **Mr. Abid Khan**, Projects Officer PILDAT and **Mr. Hamad Ullah Mangrio**, Projects Officer, PILDAT for their steady hold up and assistance for this report.

Thank You.

Mr. Mudassar Shahbaz (YP1-25-PUNJAB14)
Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on Electoral and Political System
Session 1

Ms. Momina Mindeel (YP2-23-PUNJAB12)
Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on Electoral and Political System
Session 2

Mr. Muhammad Adnan (YP3-27-PUNJAB16)
Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on Electoral and Political System
Session 3

Syed Tauqeer Mehdi Kazmi (YP4-61-GB02)
Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on Electoral and Political System
Session 4

Session wise List of Committee Members Youth Standing Committee on Political & Electoral Systems

Sr.#	Constituency Number	Name	Designation
First Session			
1	YP1-25-PUNJAB14	**Mr. Mudassar Shahbaz**	Chairperson
2	YP1-01-BALOCHISTAN01	Ms. Farida Tareen	Member
3	YP1-04-BALOCHISTAN04	Mr. Rafiullah Khan	Member
4	YP1-12-PUNJAB01	Mr. Ahmed Waqar Shah	Member
5	YP1-22-PUNJAB11	Mr. Mahboob Mohsin	Member
6	YP1-23-PUNJAB12	Mr. Majeed Ullah Khan	Member
7	YP1-27-PUNJAB16	Mr. Muhammad Daud Saleemi	Member
8	YP1-34-PUNJAB23	Mr. Sadam Hussain	Member
9	YP1-35-PUNJAB24	Ms. Sajida Naureen	Member
10	YP1-38-PUNJAB27	Mr. Umair Qadeer	Member
11	YP1-26-PUNJAB15	Mr. Muhammad Bilal Rashid	Member
12	YP1-30-PUNJAB19.	Ms. Nurjis Tahira Khan	Member
13	YP1-37-PUNJAB26	Mr. Tahir Mehmood Khattak	Member
14	YP1-54-ICT02	Ms. Irum Pervaiz	Member
Second Session			
15	YP2-23-PUNJAB12	**Ms. Momina Mindeel**	Chairperson
16	YP2-07-KP03	Mr. Faisal Raza	Member
17	YP2-08-KP04	Mr. Muhammad Bilal	Member
18	YP2-09-KP05	Mr. Rukhsana Safdar	Member
19	YP2-14-PUNJAB03	Mr. Ahmed Bilal	Member
20	YP2-17-PUNJAB06	Mr. Asad Ur Rehman	Member
21	YP2-21-PUNJAB10	Mr. Muhammad Ahsan Javaid	Member
22	YP2-24-PUNJAB13	Mr. Muhammad Awais	Member
23	YP2-27-PUNJAB16	Mr. Muhammad Umair Adil	Member
24	YP2-35-PUNJAB24	Dr. Shahid Iqbal	Member
25	YP2-44-SINDH05	Mr. Malheer Khan Pato	Member
26	YP2-46-SINDH07	Mr. Sarfaraz Ahmed Bhutto	Member
27	YP2-50-SINDH11	Syed Jazib Shamim	Member
28	YP2-51-SINDH12	Mr. Uzma Gul	Member
Third Session			
29	YP3-27-PUNJAB16	**Mr. Muhammad Adnan**	Chairperson
30	YP3-03-BALOCHISTAN03	Mr. Irfan Ullah	Member
31	YP3-04-BALOCHISTAN04	Mr. Waleed Bizenjo	Member
32	YP3-05-KP01	Mr. Aaqib Ali khan	Member
33	YP3-07-KP03	Mr. Amir Sohail	Member

Sr.#	Constituency Number	Name	Designation
34	YP3-16-PUNJAB05	Ms. Anusheh Bakht Aziz	Member
35	YP3-21-PUNJAB10	Mr. Faisal Irfan	Member
36	YP3-22-PUNJAB11	Mr. Ghulam Yaseen Ayaz	Member
38	YP3-28-PUNJAB17	Mr. Muhammad Farhan	Member
39	YP3-30-PUNJAB19	Mr. Muhammad Tayyab ShahNawaz	Member
40	YP3-32-PUNJAB21	Mr. Muhammad Usman Amjad	Member
41	YP3-41-SINDH02	Ms. Hajra Shahab	Member
42	YP3-50-SINDH11	Mr. Sarfaraz Jamali	Member
43	YP3-56-FATA02	Mr. Sohail Khan	Member
Fourth Session			
44	YP4-61-GB02	**Syed Tauqeer Mehdi Kazmi**	Chairperson
45	YP4-03-BALOCHISTAN03	Shehzada Emaad	Member
46	YP4-05-KP01	Mr. Abdul Wahid	Member
47	YP4-17-PUNJAB05	Mr. Fsahat Ul Hassan	Member
48	YP4-20-PUNJAB08	Ms. Ifrah Waqar	Member
49	YP4-28-PUNJAB16	Mr. Muhammad Talha Malik	Member
50	YP4-35-PUNJAB23	Rana Rohail Asghar	Member
51	YP4-37-PUNJAB25	Mr. Saad Shaukat	Member
52	YP4-46-SINDH06	Mir Muhammad Umar Jaffar	Member
53	YP4-47-SINDH07	Mr. Mukesh Kumar	Member
54	YP4-50-SINDH10	Mr. Saddam Hussain Lashari	Member
55	YP4-57-FATA02	Mr. Khalil Ullah	Member
56	YP4-59-AJK02	Syed Ali Raza	Member

First Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

Introduction

The existing electoral system in Pakistan is FPTP system. Comparing the underlying features of FPTP system with the political culture and ground realities of Pakistan, this committee recommends that FPTP system is suitable in the current scenario of our country. However, certain reforms should be introduced for the better working of the electoral system.

What is FPTP system?

FPTP is a constituency based electoral system in which a candidate who gains the major share of votes wins the seat. The purpose of the election is to elect a person to represent the constituency (local area), who can be either a political party representative or an independent candidate.

Policy Recommendations

i. The Election Commission of Pakistan must introduce None-of-the-above (NOTA) option on the ballot paper. If NOTA option gets the majority votes, all the contesting candidates shall stand disqualified.
ii. Article 140-A should be amended in order to make it mandatory for the provincial governments to hold local government elections within 120 days after the dissolution of previous local Government.
iii. The Parliament should place a restriction in ROPA that a candidate may only file nomination papers in one constituency.
iv. The Parliament should pass a bill making voting compulsory for every eligible voter in Pakistan, the violation of which may result in punitive measures such as fines.
v. A timely population census must be conducted to conduct free and fair elections.
vi. The Election Commission of Pakistan should give serious consideration to ensure an optimum and feasible voting system for Overseas Pakistanis.
vii. The qualification in the Constitution that the CEC and the Members of the ECP can only be selected from persons with a judicial background should be removed.
viii. The Election Commission of Pakistan must ensure Proper training of the Polling Staff to conduct fair elections.
ix. Electronic Voting Machines (EVMs) of e-balloting type should be introduced as pilot projects in Metropolitan cities, thus gradually approaching towards their nation-wide use with the tackling of problems in each phase.
x. The process of Postal balloting should be implemented for Persons with Disabilities.

Rationale behind the Recommendations

Following factors have been kept in mind while formulating the recommendations:

i. The Federal State, bicameral Legislature, regional groups, largest population of Punjab, non-institutionalized political parties, less informed voters, political disengagement, electoral history, diversified society and nascent democratic evolution.
ii. In a number of cases, the voter may not agree with the manifesto of any of the contesting candidates. So there must be an option on the ballot paper to vote out any candidate the voter does not want.
iii. It will keep Provincial Governments from delaying Local Government elections as recently witnessed in all provinces.
iv. When a candidate wins in more than one constituency, the by-elections in such constituencies burden the public exchequer and also create discontentment and ambiguity among the voters.
v. Compulsory voting can confer a high degree of political legitimacy because it results in high voter turnout. It also helps in the formation of governments with more stability and a genuine mandate.
vi. It will ensure proper registration of voters to avoid rigging in the elections.
vii. Overseas Pakistanis are an important community, which sends around $18.5 billion remittances annually. Keeping in view their valuable contribution in our economy, it is unfair to infringe their basic constitutional right to vote.
viii. The duties of Chief Election Commissioner and members of ECP are purely administrative jobs. Removing such a qualification from Article 218 of the Constitution will immediately open a much larger pool of eminent and qualified persons, who may perform these roles in a proficient way.
ix. It will improve efficiency of the electoral system by boosting up the confidence and trust of voters on the polling staff.
x. The introduction of EVMs in the electoral system will enhance accuracy and efficiency of the voting process.
xi. It is the fundamental and Constitutional right of all Pakistanis to cast their vote.

Rationale Behind FPTP System

Using PR general elections more often result in Hung

Parliaments and Coalition Governments, which may be unstable resulting in frequent changes of government. While FPTP system most of the times results in single party majority governments which are much stable. Also voters may disapprove of the terms of the coalition, which will be determined after the general election. FPTP system is a very simple system, which is easy to understand and implement for the voters. The procedure of casting and counting of votes is also relatively easy.

It is argued that General Elections held under the FPTP system result in the election of single party majority Governments, which can be held responsible and accountable for their policies at subsequent General Elections. However, under PR each party in a coalition Government may seek to take the credit for successes and to blame failures on the coalition partner. In this way the responsibility and accountability of the Government as a whole is undermined.

The concept of accountability of MPs by public in implemented only through FPTP system. As voters can easily vote out a particular MP. However, PR is mostly based on the party list system, which means that an unpopular MP may be voted out of a constituency, but nevertheless retains a seat because he is high up on the Party list. FPTP system lessens the chances of extremist parties to gain foothold in legislature, which is detrimental to national fabric and security. System based on PR is likely to encourage fragmentation and hardening of narrow identity. FPTP system gives an incentive to candidates to formulate a programmatic approach to get votes from all fragments in a constituency.

Second Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

Introduction
Currently, First Past the Post System is in place, in the country. After an in-depth study of both the systems that is; First Past the Post System (FPTP) and Proportional Representation System, this committee has concluded that given the current ethno-political societal make up of Pakistan, Proportional Representation System is better suited for Pakistan and should therefore, be implemented in order to ensure better working of the electoral system.

Contrary to what the popular belief is, PR system will not exactly be a 180-degree change in the system. Keeping in view the statistics from the 2013 elections, it is evident that 87.3% of the votes cast was for the parties. Independent candidates secured only 12.7% of the total votes. The main objection that may arise against choosing the PR system for Pakistan comprise of the fact that our literacy rate is relatively lower as compared to the countries where the PR system has proved to be successful. The critics of this system base this objection on the fact that a major chunk of our voters come from the rural areas (hence lower literacy rate will affect the implementation of the PR System) and vote for their particular candidates, regardless of what party they belong to. However, given the statistics, it can be said that the lower literacy rate will not pose as much of a problem as 87.3% of the population already had party sense or affiliation.

What is FPTP system?
FPTP (First Past the Post) voting system is or winner-takes-all, election is one that is won by the candidate receiving more votes than any others. It is a common, but not universal, feature of electoral systems with single member legislative districts, and generally results over time in a two-party competition. It is one of the plurality voting systems.

Table 1: Seat Allocation: FPTP vs. PR

Political Party	Seats won in FPTP	Seats Calculated in PR
MQM	19	14
PPPP	37	41
PTI	26	45
PML-N	130	87

What is PR system?
Proportional Representation characterizes electoral systems by which divisions in an electorate are reflected proportionately in the elected body. For instance, if out of 100 seats, a party has won 30% of the votes, it will then attain roughly 30 seats out of the total of the 100. The concept of "power in numbers" is invincible in every form within society. Proportional representation (PR), when executed suitably, is completely based on the "power in numbers" idea. It proves to the population that every vote counts. This constitutes the basic idea of the PR system
.
This data is of general seats, which are 272, and reserved seats shall be allocated accordingly.

Above analysis shows that PR is representing the parties according to their vote bank and none of the votes are being wasted that was a major flaw in the FPTP system.

Ethno-political set up of Pakistan, viability of the PR Electoral System and unsuitability of the FPTP
FPTP System works better in the societies that are homogeneous hence; one party government doesn't pose problems. However, Pakistan is a heterogeneous society as explained below. Moreover, FPTP systems which tends to bring the people of the same community to the parliament therefore tends to flourish the influence of local feudal lords and in effect weakens integration and solidarity.

Population Make-up
The male/female ratio is at about 52/48%. At present, its projected population is 188 million. The rough estimates vary, but the consensus is that the Punjabis are the largest ethnic group. Pashtuns (Pakhtuns) make up the second largest group and Sindhi are the third-largest ethnic group. Saraikis make up 10.53% of the total population. The remaining large groups include the Muhajirs and the Baloch people, which make up 7.57% and 3.57% of the total population, respectively. Hindkowans and various people of the Gilgit–Baltistan, constitute roughly 4.66% of the total population.

Moreover, the life styles, thinking and perception of the residents of the rural and urban areas also vary in a very significant manner.

Religious and sectarian make up of Pakistan
The state religion in Pakistan is Islam, which is practiced by about 95-98% of the people of the nation. The remaining 2-5% practice Christianity, Hinduism and other religions. Moreover, Muslims are further divided into sects. The majority practices Sunni

Islam. The rest of them are shias or follow other sects. Religious and sectarian clashes are also strife.

Political make up of Pakistan
A total of about 307 political parties are registered with the ECP. However, the most prominent ones in the parliament include PML-N, PPPP, PTI, MQM, JUI, JI, ANP etc. the parties in the parliament also have a much diversified leanings from leftist parties to rightist ones.

Viability of PR system in an intricately diversified Pakistan
Though PR system does not guarantee to wipe out all the difference, it does boast to create a coherence and uniformity in the decision- making. When a candidate is elected under PR system, his thinking horizon raises towards the development of all the country instead of thinking limited to his own constituency (a case in FPTP). Moreover, the grudges based on myopic provincial interests can also be dealt with. One of the pertinent role that PR plays is that it gives significance to every single vote. In a country where gender and religious discrimination have found solid footings, PR can afford an efficacious solution. Therefore, women, minorities and other unprivileged groups are dealt on equal footings and can demand due share in the nomination by the party.

Rationale behind adopting the PR system
Vote turnout is likely to increase to a significant amount. The reason for this is that with plurality, one can only count on the larger parties to win; therefore, instead of "throwing away" a vote for a smaller, less popular party, the voter would either vote for the larger party or not vote at all. "Because seats can be gained [in PR] with only a fraction of the total vote, voters have fewer incentives to abandon their most preferred candidates.

Hence, the minorities will now be benefitted, contrary to the popular belief. Moreover, the political parties will now concentrate more on public and neglected areas in general instead of focusing on their particular constituencies or getting the electable join their party.

PR system supports multi-member districts, which again are suitable for Pakistan. Since, they are already in place in the country; it goes on to reiterate the fact that this will not be a 180-degree shift in the system. Moreover, another concern that is likely to be raised is that the smaller provinces will get even less representation. However, we would like to clarify that the seat allocation formula will remain the same, as in the FPTP.

Pre-Election Procedure (Recommendations to improve the PR system)
6 to 8 months before the end of the Constitutional tenure of the incumbent Government, registered Political Parties from the Election Commission will announce the opening of the nomination forms for the tickets for the national and provincial assemblies. Election Commission shall constitute a formula that shall be implemented on all the parties for evaluation of the candidates on the basis of few factors that may include party affiliation, public popularity etc. Parties will announce the merit list of the finalized nominated candidates after the scrutiny of their nominations forms and will be open to the public for public opinion. After getting public responses, the parties would send the final list to the election commission no later than 4 to 6 months before the tenure of the government. To ensure transparency and merit, Election Commission shall formulate a set pattern for the nomination of candidates among parties. Election Commission will scrutinize and issue the final list of the contesting candidates of all the assemblies not later than 3 months before the end of tenure of the government.

The caretaker Government according to the prevailing practice would conduct elections. Election Commission will allot the seats to the parties according to proportion of the total number of votes secured by the parties.

Policy Recommendations (To remove the flaws of the PR system, in order to make it more suitable)

i. Article 140-A should be amended in order to make it mandatory for the provincial governments to hold local government elections within 120 days after the dissolution of previous local government. In case, any provincial government fails to act on it, Chief Minister of that particular interim government will be held answerable.
ii. The Parliament should pass a bill asking the media to do responsible awareness programs regarding the system so as to encourage the eligible voters to exercise their right to vote.
iii. The parties in power must conduct a timely population census to conduct free and fair elections and to stop Gerrymandering. The population consensus should be held after every five years; each government having to conduct it once during its tenure. In Pakistan, it has almost been 18 years since the population consensus took place.
iv. The qualification in the Constitution that the CEC and the Members of the ECP can only be selected from persons with a judicial background should be removed.

v. Secondly, the Leader of the House and Leader of the Opposition currently recommends the members of the ECP. The leaders of the smaller parties should have a say too.
vi. The Election Commission of Pakistan must ensure Proper training of the Polling Staff to conduct fair elections, as it is going to be a new system and the people as well as the polling staff need to know how it works in reality.
vii. Electronic Voting Machines (EVMs) of e-balloting type should be introduced as pilot projects in Metropolitan cities, thus gradually approaching towards their nation-wide use with the tackling of problems in each phase.

Rationale behind the Recommendations

Following factors have been considered while formulating the recommendations, in order to address the probable loopholes:

i. It will keep the Provincial Governments from delaying Local Government elections as recently witnessed in all provinces. Moreover, since now the PR system has been put in place and the minority parties have been represented in the assembly, it will further strengthen the PR System as it will train the local people regarding the election procedure, use of ballet paper etc. in general and for the next elections in particular. Moreover, local body system will be strengthened.
ii. As we all know the impact media can have on the people of the country can be colossal, media needs to be made aware of its responsibilities so it does not lean towards one particular party but participate in the awareness program responsibly, as it is a new system and the general population needs to be made aware of it.
iii. The following table will explain the rationale behind holding timely population consensus and how it will strengthen the PR system:

Currently, the distribution of the seats in the National Assembly among Provinces being followed is on the basis of the estimated population but census in Pakistan has not been conducted for the past 18 years.

The seat distribution should be made on the basis of the registered voters as ECP always has an updated record. Moreover, electoral process is concerned with registered voters not with population. Short study of comparison of the seat distribution among provinces is given below as,

So from the above analysis, it can be concluded that much difference won't occur but only better representation of the voters is going to happen in comparison to FPTP.

i. The duties of Chief Election Commissioner and members of ECP are purely administrative jobs. Removing such a qualification from Article 218 of the Constitution will immediately open a much larger pool of eminent and qualified persons, who may perform these roles in a proficient way.
ii. Unlike FPTP, now a number of parties will get representation in the Assembly so it is important that all of them have a say in the decision of the ECP.
iii. It will improve efficiency of the electoral system by boosting up the confidence and trust of voters on the polling staff.

The introduction of EVMs in the electoral system will enhance accuracy and efficiency of the voting process. Since, it is not just two or three parties that are the major stakeholders in the Government; we need to have a better system to record the votes

Table 2: Comparison of seat distribution in both scenarios in NA

Province	Total Seats in Current Scenario	According to the proposed Scenario i.e. Registered Voters	
		Percentage	Seats
Balochistan	14	3.8	10
KPK	35	15.29	42
Sindh	61	21.6	58
Punjab	148	55	153

Third Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

What is FPTP?

Introduction
First Past The Post is a simple plurality electoral system in which the winning candidate only needs a plurality of votes i.e. one vote more than their leading opponent in order to win their seat.

What is PR?
Proportional representation (PR) characterizes electoral systems by which divisions in an electorate are reflected proportionately in the elected body. If 30% of the electorate support a particular political party, then roughly 30% of seats will be won by that party.

Dynamics of Political Setup in Pakistan
i. Existing system of Pakistan
ii. Time Constraints
iii. Personality based election

Rationale
i. In FPTP, single party Government is stable
ii. Majority party will be held responsible
iii. Accountability of member of parliaments
iv. Accessibility
v. Extremist party will be streamed in main stream politics
vi. Encouragement of independent candidates
vii. Constituency based elections
viii. Discouragement of exploitation of small Provinces
ix. Elimination of power politics
x. Time Constraints

Recommendations
i. Extension of days for scrutiny from 7 to 20 (Representation Of Public Act)
ii. State institutes must help ECP in scrutiny procedure
iii. Strengthening of local governments (Article 140 A)
iv. Bio-Metric system to be experimented in by-elections
v. Chief Election Commissioner can be of any background (Article 218)
vi. Upper Age Limit of CEC (67 years)
vii. Population census must be held
viii. Proper training for free and fair elections

Fourth Session Report: 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

Introduction

The General Elections of 2013 brought a plethora of issues into open that created much hue and cry over the Electoral system in general and the administrative issues of conducting the elections in particular. Most of the emphasis put by the opposition parties was confined to the effectiveness of the Election Commission in ensuring fairness of polling at certain constituencies. The country director of the UNDP Pakistan stated on the question of General Elections of 2013, "In Pakistan, despite the differences, there is recognition among stakeholders, local and international, that electoral reforms are required "…. Also on a nationwide survey of 4,535 people by UNDP, it found that 49 per cent were not satisfied with the existing electoral system while 55 per cent said electoral reforms are necessary ".

Within the broader ambit of Electoral reforms, the question of voting system becomes crucial. Pakistan follows the First Past the post system, a continuation of the British Colonial legacy. However the experience of 2013 elections necessitates that we reconsider and highlight the two systems i.e. FPTP and PR, their salient features and their advantages and disadvantages. Research and detailed study of the two systems led us to the conclusion that Pakistan, with its unique societal make-up and distinct political dynamics, is more suited to the Proportional Representation system.

This Report is divided into three parts. The first part deals with ethno-political make-up of Pakistan and comprises of facts and figures pertaining to it. The second part deals with an explanation and critique of two systems of representation i.e. First Past the Post (FPTP) and Proportional Representation (PR) system. The third part deals with detailed recommendations that we propose in in favour of implementation of PR system in Pakistan and the rationale behind such recommendations.

Unique Ethno-Political societal make-up of Pakistan

Sr. #	Ethnic Diversity
1.	Punjabis: 44.68%
2.	Pashtuns: 15.42%
3.	Sindhis: 14.1%
4.	Saraikis: 8.38%
5.	Muhajirs: 7.57%
6.	Balochis: 3.57%
7.	Others: 6.28%
Sr. #	**Religious Diversity**
1.	Islam: 96.4%
2.	Hinduism: 1.4%
3.	Christians: 1.6%
4.	Others: 0.6%

Political Parties

According to the official statistics of General Elections of 2013, Pakistan had 216 registered political parties that participated in the elections. Out of these, the parties that managed to win most of the seats in the Parliament, using the First-Past-The-Post-System, in order of their representation were:

i. Pakistan Muslim League (N)
ii. Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP)
iii. Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI)
iv. Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM)
v. Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (F) (JUI-F)
vi. Pakistan Muslim League (Q) (PML-Q)
vii. Pakistan Muslim League (F) (PML-F)
viii. Jamaat-E-Islami (JI)
ix. Awami National Party (ANP)

First Past the Post system

i. It is one of the types of plurality voting systems i.e. a single-winner voting system in which one out of multiple candidates is to be elected through a single non-transferable vote. This system is also known as "Single Member District Plurality", a phrase used in order to differentiate it from the Proportional Representation System.
ii. A simple plurality of votes is required by the candidate to win.
iii. One variant of this system is the "runoff" plurality system, in which a two-tiered election is held. The candidate must get more than 50% votes in the first tier in order to win. If that does not happen, a second "runoff" round is conducted in between the two candidates securing the highest votes in the first tier.
iv. Another popular variant is the "Multiple Non Transferable Vote", which is usually used in local bodies' elections in Pakistan. In this system, a slate or panel of multiple members is elected through a single non-transferable vote.
v. First past the post is the most widely followed system in the world, partly owing to the fact that

British colonial administration favoured this system in contrast to others.

vi. Many countries have changed from FPTP to other systems however rarely has any country opted FPTP in favour of any other system due to a plethora of inherent flaws that exist in it.

Proportional Representation System

i. It is a system, which ensures that the representation of a particular party in the parliament is proportional with the votes secured by the party.
ii. Rather than the winner-take all approach of other systems, PR ensures that votes carry equal weight. To do this, multi-member constituencies are used. This means that a single area elects more than one representative.
iii. Party List Proportional Representation envisages that voters vote for the party and therefore the list as a whole. The list may be open or closed, which means that a candidate may choose individual candidates from the list, or choose the list as a whole (as decided by the party) until all the seats have been filled.

First Past the Post

Arguments in favour

i. It is simple to understand and thus doesn't cost much to administer.
ii. It doesn't take very long to count all the votes and work out who's won, meaning results can be declared a handful of hours after polls close.
iii. It tends to produce a two-party system, which in turn tends to produce single-party Governments, which don't have to rely on support from other parties to pass legislation.
iv. Parties have to appeal to the centre ground to win elections, so it encourages centrist policies

Arguments Against

i. It encourages tactical voting, as many voters vote not for the candidate they like the most, but against the candidate they most dislike.
ii. The majority of votes have no impact; as votes cast in a constituency for losing candidates, or for the winning candidate above the level they need to win that seat, count for nothing.
iii. First Past the Post severely restricts voter choice. Parties are coalitions of many different viewpoints. If you support a party, but not your local candidate, you don't have a means of saying so at the ballot box.
iv. With relatively small constituency sizes, the way boundaries are drawn can have important effects on the election result, which encourages attempts at gerrymandering (The practice of altering district boundaries in order to favour the party).
v. Because First Past the Post restricts a constituency's choice of candidates, representation of minorities and women suffers from 'most broadly acceptable candidate syndrome', where the 'safest' looking candidate is the most likely to be offered a chance to stand for election.
vi. In a multi-party culture, third parties with significant support can be greatly disadvantaged.

Proportional Representation System: Pros and Cons

Arguments in favour

i. Party-list systems guarantee a high degree of party proportionality.
ii. Every vote has equal value.
iii. It couldn't be simpler: voters have to make one choice out of a small selection.
iv. List systems tend to involve large multi-member constituencies, which give more opportunities for women and minority groups to gain representation.
v. Open lists offer voters more choice and control over who is elected
vi. Closed lists are more amenable to measures that can increase the representation of women, such as gender quotas.

Arguments Against

i. Closed party lists are completely impersonal, weakening any link between the representative and a regional area.
ii. Closed party lists offer very little in the way of voter choice: all the power, save that of choosing a party for Government, resides with the party leaders.
iii. As the party leaders select candidates, they are likely to put 'safe' candidates near the top of the list, at the expense of traditionally under-represented groups.
iv. Party lists discriminate against those not willing to be part of the party structure, and it is difficult to

Table 3: National Assembly of Pakistan: Conversion table from FPTP to PR

Political Party	Seats Won in FPTP	Seats Calculated in PR
PML-N	130	87
PTI	26	45
PPPP	37	41
MQM	19	14

stand as an independent candidate.

v. Highly proportional systems with minimal thresholds can result in a fragmented Parliament, and produce unstable, multi-party Governments.

Example of PR system in Turkey

In Turkish Electoral System, Political parties present lists of candidates; these must be submitted in at least half the provinces. Electors cast a ballot for a single list or an independent candidate. However, in order to participate in the distribution of the Grand National Assemble seats, a political party must obtain at least ten per cent of the nationwide vote. This system is in line with our idea of a system of Proportional Representation in Pakistan.

Recommendations

The Electoral and Political System prevalent in Pakistan has faced severe criticism right from the start. Weak institutions, destabilised system and lack of political will are some of the major root causes. In order to address the existing drawbacks and gaps in the current electoral system, a three-pronged strategy must be undertaken that specifically identifies immediate, short-term and long-term measures. For this purpose, the Committee has proposed the following recommendations:

Immediate Measures

i. Agenda setting: The first step in this regard must be taken is the clear setting of principles, ensuring political will and the headway indicators. Managing public expectations is vital for averting disappointments.

ii. Increased coordination: Increased coordination between provinces and federation is the need of the hour. Coordination is vitally important between various government departments and ministries. Consistency in policies is a must for advancement of implementation process.

iii. Amendment in article 218(b): The Article states that only members who have been a part of the higher judiciary can be elected as members of ECP. Any other member from a higher administrative post should be allowed to be a part of ECP.

iv. Awareness programs by ECP: ECP should ensure that the media conducts responsible awareness programs regarding the system so as to encourage the eligible voters to exercise their right to vote.

v. Census: the parties in power must conduct a timely population census to conduct free and fair elections and to stop any kind of manipulation. The Government in power should do this after every ten years. In Pakistan it has almost been 18 years since the population consensus took place, which has had a negative impact on the electoral process.

vi. Proper training: The election commission of Pakistan must insure proper training of the polling staff to conduct free and fair elections, as it is going to be a new system and the people as well as the staff should be prepared in order to implement it.

Middle Term Measures

i. Syllabus containing an easy introduction to electoral and political process in Pakistan should be introduced at the school level.

ii. District Returning Officers (DROs) and Returning Officers' (RO) selection criterion as given in the section of Representation of People's Act (ROPA) should be amended. In its place, a special criterion to nominate members from administrative department of the government having good reputation to fulfill the role/duty of PROs and ROs should be appointed.

iii. A certain incentive should be introduced in order to initiate and promote increase in the voter turnout. For example voters should be exempted from a certain percentage of tax which might range from 0.5-1.5 percentage.

iv. Electronic Voting Machines (EVMs) of e-balloting type should be introduced as a part of the pilot project in Metropolitan cities, hence, gradually approaching towards their nation-wide use with the tacking of problems in each phase.

Long Term Measures

i. The duration of the Chief Election Commissioner should be of 6 years and only supreme judicial council of Pakistan should have the mandate to remove the Chief Election Commissioner, under any circumstances.

ii. Over the time, the number of ECP members should be reduced to two. One member can be a sitting Judge of High Court and the other may be an experienced administrative officer with a good record of managing skills to help the Chief Election Commissioner in managing the operations of ECP.

iii. Candidates or their supporters should ensure security of polling stations so that it may be approachable to all voters in order to increase the voter turnout as well as to prevent any due pressure on the voters.

Rationale for the Recommendations

The corresponding rationale for each of the recommendations given above is presented below in order:

Immediate Measures

i. A clear setting of agenda is a must to achieve any

specific goal. Without a clear direction no substantive progress can be achieved.

ii. No progress can be accomplished in implementation of any policy without a proper coordination mechanism between different government departments and offices. A good coordination is an indicator of effective implementation.

iii. Article 218(b) states only judges from higher judiciary can be elected as ECP judges which rather narrows the selection criterion. Instead of restricting membership criterion, senior civil servants should also be considered for serving as members of ECP.

iv. Awareness programs by ECP will help in dissemination of the basic know-how of the electoral process ensuring more electorally aware citizens.

v. Without a census, the ground realities of a country especially where the mindset of voters and their number is concerned cannot be judged properly. Thus it can lead to wide exaggeration of policies formulated or misreading of the ground reality by the Government.

vi. Proper training of the election staff is essential to conduct successful elections. Since PR is being recommended as a system, staff should be given appropriate training to conduct and guide people based on this new system.

Middle Term Measures

i. It has been observed that people in Pakistan face difficulty in understanding the technicalities of the electoral process and most of them don't have the basic knowledge as to how the system works and what are their duties and responsibilities pertaining to this system. An easy introduction of this process at the school level will help inculcate the basic understanding of this system.

ii. The selection criterion of DROs and ROs should not be restricted to only officials from judiciary. Government officials from administrative division having good reputation may be selected to ensure effectiveness in implementation.

iii. Voter turnout in Pakistan has always been low as compared to other countries.

iv. Special incentives in this regard may help increase in the voter turnout especially in urban areas. In order to ensure complete transparency and to end the debate of partiality and controversy, EVMs in this regard will help in holding of free and fair elections. This system should be introduced in a step-by-step process starting from metropolitan cities and based on their success; they should be gradually introduced in other cities as well.

Long Term Measures

i. The duration of Chief Election Commissioner should be of 6 years in order to ensure consistency in policies of the ECP. Only supreme judicial council should be mandated to remove the Chief Election Commissioner because supreme judicial council is composed of senior judges of the Supreme Court who are the most appropriate to judge in this regard.

ii. The composition of ECP members should be altered over time as induction of one judge from higher judiciary and one official possessing good administrative skills will add to the performance ability of the Election Commission.

iii. On the polling day, security of polling stations is a matter of utmost importance. Most voters especially women in backward areas refrain from going to polling stations due to these concerns. Ensuring security of polling stations will not only result in an increase of the voter turnout but will also limit any pressure that may be inflicted upon by the political party.

Secretariat, Youth Parliament Pakistan
Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@youthparliament.pk | Website: www.youthparliament.pk