



7th YOUTH PARLIAMENT PAKISTAN

Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations

**Report: Pakistan's National Action Plan (December 2014): What is the State of its
Implementation and Possible Proposals for Effective Implementation & Oversight**

February 2016



Secretariat Youth Parliament Pakistan



7th YOUTH PARLIAMENT PAKISTAN

Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations

**Report: Pakistan's National Action Plan (December 2014): What is the State of its
Implementation and Possible Proposals for Effective Implementation & Oversight**

February 2016



Secretariat Youth Parliament Pakistan

PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan. It also serves as Secretariat, Youth Parliament Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: February 2016

ISBN: 978-969-558-610-5

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.



Secretariat, Youth Parliament Pakistan

Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan

Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan

E-mail: info@youthparliament.pk | Website: www.youthparliament.pk

CONTENTS

PREFACE

Acknowledgments

| | |
|---|----|
| List of Committee Members | 09 |
| First Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan | 11 |
| Introduction | 11 |
| Revamping the Criminal Justice System | 11 |
| Karachi Operation | 11 |
| Hate Speech | 11 |
| Border Management and Afghan Refugees | 12 |
| NACTA | 12 |
| Balochistan Reconciliation | 12 |
| Conclusion | 13 |
| Second Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan | 14 |
| Executive Summary | 14 |
| Background | 14 |
| Why was NAP introduced? | 14 |
| Critical Analysis | 14 |
| a. The Status of Implementation of the National Action Plan | 14 |
| b. What are the bodies required to oversee the implementation of the NAP? How many reports of implementation of the NAP have been submitted to those since December 2014? | 16 |
| c. How do other countries monitor implementation of similar national security strategies? | 17 |
| d. What is the role of media in the implementation of the National Action Plan? | 18 |
| Other Recommendations and their Rationale | 18 |
| Third Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan | 20 |
| Executive Summary | 20 |
| Background | 20 |
| National Action Plan (NAP); December 2014 | 20 |
| National Action Plan; Status of Implementation | 21 |
| a. Bodies Responsible for Implementation of NAP | 21 |
| b. Policy Recommendations with Rationale | 21 |
| c. Normative Analysis/Comparison with other Countries | 22 |
| Fourth Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan | 23 |
| Abstract | 23 |
| Introduction | 23 |
| Basic problems of implementation | 23 |
| The bodies required to over seeing the implementation of the NAP | 23 |
| Role of media and the Citizens | 28 |
| The India and UK Models | 28 |
| Conclusion | 28 |

PREFACE

After the successful completion of 6 terms since 2007, the 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan was launched in July 2015.

The specific objectives of the Youth Parliament Pakistan (YPP) programme are to inculcate democratic culture and spirit of tolerance for others views among the youth; to expose them to the political and parliamentary processes; to facilitate youth to express their views on various national, international, regional and local issues thereby helping the government and society at large to better understand the concerns of the youth; to groom the leadership potential of the youth of Pakistan by exposing them to peaceful and democratic resolution of differences especially at a time when various parts of Pakistan are suffering from conflict and extremism. Finally this provides a forum to the youth of Pakistan to understand how the Parliament works as the supreme public representative institution in a democracy.

The 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan, under a revised model, managed to enroll 240 young people from all over Pakistan. 4 Sessions were held, in which 60 new Members participated in 5-day training programme.

Youth Standing Committees of the 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan were tasked to develop cogent policy alternatives for the Parliament and Government of Pakistan. Each Committee was assigned a particular policy area and the Committees managed to develop a set concise policy recommendations in the shape of a Report. Each Committee presented and defended the Report to a Panel of Experts. The 4 Standing Committees for the current term are:

1. **Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations**
2. **Youth Standing Committee on Finance**
3. **Youth Standing Committee on Political and Electoral System**
4. **Youth Standing Committee on Governance**

Report topics given to each of the respective Youth Standing Committee were:

1. Pakistan's National Action Plan (December 2014): What is the State of its Implementation and Possible Proposals for Effective Implementation & Oversight.
2. Pakistan's Extended Fund Facility (EFF) Plan with the IMF and its Short-Term and Long-Term Economic Impact on Pakistan.
3. Is Pakistan more suited to adopt the Proportional Representation (PR) Electoral System versus the First-Past-The-Post (FPTP) Electoral System: Rationale & Proposals
4. What are the best International models for measuring Quality of Governance and why?

The Committees have gone through a process of intensive research, consultations with policy experts and internal review within Committees before putting together their proposals. The initial findings were shared before the House in Youth Parliament and with the Secretariat Youth Parliament Pakistan who gave their comments on these drafts. After incorporating these inputs, the reports are finalised by individual Committees. Going through this rigour the participants not only experienced the process of drafting policy in a democratic fashion but also formulated useful recommendation in the form of this report.

The reports are compiled and finally published for the purpose of dissemination. The reports are also available online at

The 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan is supported by the Danish International Development Agency, Government of Denmark, as recognition of the importance of young people's development in democracy and democratic practices.

Disclaimer

The Secretariat of Youth Parliament Pakistan has provided unbiased feedback in a timely manner on the research reports and the scientific value of the work done by MYP's. The Secretariat has given guidance in ensuring the content is clear, concise, and relevant to the current pool of knowledge in regard to originality, and interest to the readers. The opinions, findings or recommendations expressed in this report belong to the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of PILDAT or DANIDA.

Acknowledgments

This research report is a sincere composition and hard work of many intellectual minds who have given thoughtful recommendations and analysis on Electoral Reforms in Pakistan.

We, the Chairpersons for (PILDAT) Youth Parliament Pakistan's Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations, would like to thank all our Committee Members who made these reports possible with their ideas and planning. Our appreciations go to our colleagues in developing the report with the best of their knowledge.

We are highly indebted to President PILDAT **Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob** and Joint Director **Ms. Aasiya Riaz** for their guidance and constant supervision as well as providing necessary information regarding the project and for their support in completing the report.

We would also like to thank **Ms. Aimen Khan**, Projects Manager PILDAT, **Mr. Abid Khan**, Projects Officer PILDAT and **Mr. Hamad Ullah Mangrio**, Projects Officer, PILDAT for their steady hold up and assistance for this report.

Thank You.

Ms. Rutaba Tariq (YP1-44-SINDH05)

Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations
Session 1

Ms. Batool Abid Memon (YP2-42-SINDH03)

Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations
Session 2

Ms. Zoha Khalid (YP3-54-ICT02)

Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations
Session 3

Mr. Fateh Ullah Khan (YP4-08-KP04)

Chairperson, Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations
Session 4

Session wise List of Committee Members Youth Standing Committee on National Security & Foreign Relations

| Sr.# | Constituency Number | Name | Designation |
|-----------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|-------------|
| First Session | | | |
| 1 | YP1-44-SINDH05 | Ms. Rutaba Tariq | Chairperson |
| 2 | YP1-03-BALUCHISTAN03 | Mr. Nadeem Ullah Khan | Member |
| 3 | YP1-07-KP03 | Mr. Irfan Ullah Khan | Member |
| 4 | YP1-13-PUNJAB02 | Mr. Anas Munir | Member |
| 5 | YP1-33-PUNJAB22 | Mr. Rana Musa Tahir | Member |
| 6 | YP1-46-SINDH07 | Mr. Sikander Hayat Sarmad | Member |
| 7 | YP1-47-SINDH08 | Mr. Sohaib Nehal | Member |
| 8 | YP1-48-SINDH09 | Ms. Soonh Ladhi | Member |
| 9 | YP1-49-SINDH10 | Syed Asad Raza | Member |
| 10 | YP1-50-SINDH11 | Syed Nousherwan Haroon Kirmani | Member |
| 11 | YP1-53-ICT01 | Mr. Daniyal Hassan | Member |
| 12 | YP1-57-AJK01 | Mr. Nuaman Ishfaq Mughal | Member |
| 13 | YP1-59-GB01 | Mr. Awais Ali Khan | Member |
| 14 | YP1-60-GB02 | Mr. Mudassar Hassan | Member |
| 15 | YP1-14-PUNJAB03 | Mr. Ansar Ali | Member |
| Second Session | | | |
| 16 | YP2-42-SINDH03 | Ms. Batool Abid Memon | Chairperson |
| 17 | YP2-03-BALUCHISTAN03 | Syed Ali Yaseenzai | Member |
| 18 | YP2-04-BALUCHISTAN04 | Mr. Zia Ur Rehman | Member |
| 19 | YP2-12-PUNJAB01 | Mr. Ali Husnain Bajwa | Member |
| 20 | YP2-16-PUNJAB05 | Mr. Anas Yasin | Member |
| 21 | YP2-28-PUNJAB17 | Mr. Muhammad Umer | Member |
| 22 | YP2-31-PUNJAB20 | Mr. Muhammad Tehsin Sarfraz | Member |
| 23 | YP2-34-PUNJAB23 | Mr. Omer Aamir | Member |
| 24 | YP2-45-SINDH06 | Mr. Muhammad Ismail Khursheed | Member |
| 25 | YP2-49-SINDH10 | Syed Ahmed Raza | Member |
| 26 | YP2-52-SINDH13 | Mr. Ziyad Sohail | Member |
| 27 | YP2-54-ICT02 | Mr. Sunil Jamil | Member |
| 28 | YP2-56-FATA02 | Mr. Rafi ud din | Member |
| 29 | YP2-59-GB01 | Mr. Muhammad Latif | Member |
| Third Session | | | |
| 30 | YP3-54-ICT02 | Ms. Zoha Khalid | Chairperson |
| 31 | YP3-01-BALUCHISTAN01 | Mr. Abdul Baseer | Member |
| 32 | YP3-12-PUNJAB01 | Mr. Abdul Ahad | Member |
| 33 | YP3-15-PUNJAB04 | Mr. Ans Khurram | Member |
| 34 | YP3-18-PUNJAB07 | Mr. Asia Maqsood | Member |
| 35 | YP3-24-PUNJAB13 | Ms. Mariam Hassan Naqvi | Member |
| 36 | YP3-29-PUNJAB18 | Mr. Muhammad Imtiaz Azam | Member |
| 37 | YP3-31-PUNJAB20 | Mr. Zain Ul Abideen Sohail | Member |
| 38 | YP3-37-PUNJAB26 | Mr. Talal Mustahsan Raza | Member |
| 39 | YP3-38-PUNJAB27 | Ms. Tehmina Qazi | Member |
| 40 | YP3-44-SINDH05 | Mr. Hassan Abbas Awan | Member |

| | | | |
|-----------------------|----------------------|---------------------------------|-------------|
| 41 | YP3-46-SINDH07 | Mr. Mariya Farheen | Member |
| 42 | YP3-51-SINDH12 | Syed Hassaan Hassan Hashmi | Member |
| 43 | YP3-53-ICT01 | Ms. SHAHANA KHAN | Member |
| Fourth Session | | | |
| 44 | YP4-08-KP04 | Mr. Fateh Ullah Khan | Chairperson |
| 45 | YP4-02-BALUCHISTAN02 | Mr. Shahnawaz Baloch | Member |
| 46 | YP4-12-KP08 | Mr. Aziz Ullah Surani | Member |
| 47 | YP4-06-KP02 | Mr. Ilyas Khan | Member |
| 48 | YP4-09-KP05 | Mr. Qaiser Nawab | Member |
| 49 | YP4-13-PUNJAB01 | Mr. Ali Jan Awan | Member |
| 50 | YP4-19-PUNJAB07 | Ms. Hira Khan | Member |
| 51 | YP4-27-PUNJAB15 | Mr. Muhammad Ghulam Jilani Khan | Member |
| 52 | YP4-30-PUNJAB18 | Mr. Muhammad Usman Haider | Member |
| 53 | YP4-33-PUNJAB21 | Ms. Purniya Awan | Member |
| 54 | YP4-42-SINDH02 | Mr. Asad Palijo | Member |
| 55 | YP4-44-SINDH04 | Ms. Kinza Abdi | Member |
| 56 | YP4-48-SINDH08 | Ms. Yumna Khan | Member |
| 57 | YP4-49-SINDH09 | Ms. Nehel Hafeez | Member |
| 58 | YP4-56-FATA01 | Mr. Arif Ullah Khan | Member |

First Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

Introduction

In January 2015, Government of Pakistan unveiled its 'National Action Plan', (NAP) to crack down on terrorism and to supplement the ongoing anti-terrorist offense in North-West Pakistan. It is considered as a major coordinated state retaliation following the deadly Peshawar School Attack. NAP received unprecedented levels of support across the country's political spectrum, inclusive of federal and provincial governments.

The following report 'Pakistan's National Action Plan: What is the state of its Implementation and Possible Proposals for Effective Implementation and Oversight' attempts to provide possible proposals that can bring betterment to the state of implementation of the NAP.

Revamping the Criminal Justice System

One of the major reasons for the failure of conviction of terrorists and other criminals involved in heinous crimes is the inefficiency of the Criminal Justice System. The system comprises mainly of the police, prosecution and jail system. Unfortunately all three branches of the criminal justice system have failed to work in collaboration to secure convictions and eradicate crime. It is for this reason that we have a parallel court structure in the form of anti-terrorist courts, which deal only with terrorist cases. In order to bring about a major reform, the parallel court structure ought to be merged into the regular courts and the system needs to be strengthened.

- i. Defective and irresponsible investigation, as well as prosecution, be penalized.
- ii. Supervisory role of the Supreme Court and High Courts can be made more functional, by monitoring of monthly reports of cases/appeals which are pending/convicted/acquitted.
- iii. New evidential tools needed to be developed in federal and provincial govt. agencies for effective prosecution of cases, and changes may be brought to Qanun-e-Shahadat Order 1984 to the same effect.
- iv. Protection of jails, judges, witnesses and public prosecutors should be ensured at all stages of trial.

Karachi Operation

On September 5, 2013, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif directed the authorities to launch Karachi operation to root out crime and terrorism from the megalopolis. It was also included in 20 points of National Action Plan to take the ongoing operation in Karachi to its logical.

In a report issued by Sindh Police, target killings have declined 59% after the targeted operation in Karachi. However, there are still few areas which need improvement for the long term solution of the city's law and order problem. On top of it is the improvement in local policing system by making it independent, free from political pressure, and equipped with modern training and equipment. Recently few objections have been raised about torture, missing persons, and extrajudicial killings of political workers by LEAs. This is very important to have a watchdog body, as it was decided in Apex Committee meeting, so that the concerns of all the stakeholders of the city may be heard and solved accordingly.

Hate Speech

The National Action Plan recognizes hate speech as a potent threat to national security and emphasizes on countering it. While there is a proper system for the registration of madaris involving the regional Aukaf committees, IMTP and the Federal Ministry of Religious Affairs, out of a total of 34,380 madaris, 26,131 are registered leaving 8,249 unregistered.

PEMRA has considerable powers when it comes to regulation of the electronic media. But instead of enforcing such rules, it has become a mere license granting authority. The authorities that monitor social media include PTA, FIA and the Ministry of Information. So far, the only feat they have in their repertoire is the blocking of YouTube and pornographic sites.

Submission of financial statements and education records by the madaris on semiannual basis, accounting for the source of funding and the students enrolled and residing on madaris grounds. Secondly an introduction of a reformed curriculum that dispels the misinterpretation of Quran injunctions by extremist factions and curriculum to be sorted out by a committee of ITMP, renowned religious scholars, education experts and the Ministry of Religious Affairs.

Unregistered madaris to be given a time frame of 6 months to get themselves registered. Failure from their end should be dealt with penalties and applications for registration to be thoroughly scrutinized before awarding the madrassah license to operate.

Effective coordination of the ITMP, regional Aukaf boards with the Federal Ministry of Religious Affairs to ensure proper following of registration procedure, and a central Friday sermon to be developed and distributed to mosques countrywide by the Ministry of Religious Affairs.

PTA to monitor the social networking websites and implement a method for inappropriate content filtering, on the other hand print media authorities to exercise their control over printing presses to stop publishing of offensive and inciting literature.

Border Management and Afghan Refugees

In the contemporary scenario Pakistan is bearing the burden of 1.64million registered and 1.4million unregistered afghan refugees respectively. The ratio of border crossing is 500 legal and fifteen to twenty thousand illegal border crossing per day via Torkham border only. While the ratio of repatriation is very slow i.e. sixteen thousand Afghans repatriated last year, although the police campaigns against unregistered Afghans are in process without major successes to deport them.

The Foreign Ministries of Pakistan and Afghanistan should increase their number of meetings and paradigm of their collective efforts to ensure illegal border crossings through increasing the number of check posts along both sides of the Durand line especially on Afghan side. It will prevent the militia groups to penetrate to Afghanistan or vice-versa.

The volunteer repatriation of Afghan refugees should be admired till December 2015. On the other hand side, the remaining refugees should be forced to repatriate using both soft and hard measures. Till than limit the registered Afghan refugees to a certain region for their proper management and to resolve the data handling issues. This strategy will also be helpful to resolve particular issues of refugees.

NACTA

All national security briefings to be given with consultation of Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Defense and Ministry of Information

Composition of APEX committees is defined by the Provincial Governments with consultation from the federal government. Currently, the only information on the structural details of the APEX committee is provided by the ISPR, lacking in defining the terms of the committees composition and charter. The reform intends to empower, put in charge and/or help a) The Provincial authorities: Keeping in light the reality of how terrorism's nature and intensity differs from one province to another, provincial authorities be given the power to, under the NAP, structure their specific mandates, and approach federal government for help b) Bring the much absent autonomy to the provinces, and help overcome the fear of centralization bias that persist within smaller provinces.

Standing Committee of Defence should monitor APEX Committee

NACTA's expected goal is to coordinate intelligence sharing and implement the NISP and NAP, the committee can therein periodically overview NACTA's working in reference to the counter-terrorism efforts relayed on provincial level. The Committee can also operate as a common ground for NACTA and provincial authorities to work on, as none so far exist.

NACTA be put under PM's Secretariat

NAP states of 'strengthening and activating' NACTA yet there has been failure in its basic structuring. The legal status of NACTA has been dubious. The question arises whether NACTA is an autonomous authority or an executive authority that operates strictly under the wing of the Prime Minister. The reform suggests that NACTA be put under PM's office, independent of the Ministry of Interior, so: a) The confusion on the legal status eradicates b) The broad ranging scope of NISP be tackled effectively c) eradicate the reluctance of the various intelligence agencies with regards to sharing information and improve communication.

Clearly defined budget be immediately allocated to the bodies in-charge of implementing NAP and NISP, with additional allocations from provincial and federal revenues shares: Funds have only been recently announced for NACTA, and there are none released for the NISP. It is imperative if the implementation of NAP and activation of NACTA is to be achieved that federal government starts making fiscal allocations to organizations related to the implementation of both NISP and NAP. And in light of the importance of national security in Pakistan, federal and provincial revenue shares too should be allocated for better implementation.

Timely and merit based appointment of NACTA's members: Current appointment of National Coordinator of NACTA is a welcome step in fighting the dormant state of NACTA, yet the organization presently has hardly a complete working body.

NISP be presented to Senate: A major aspect of NACTA's work falls under the implementation of NISP. Currently the policy is not up for official discussion in the Senate.

Balochistan Reconciliation

One of the biggest challenges of Pakistan is the ongoing issues in Balochistan and the constant evolution in these issues on daily basis. Baluchistan faces major challenges on the following issues;

i. Separatist insurgencies, the ongoing activities of

- private militias and the most critical and most common issue of the missing persons.
- ii. Meaningful dialogue should be started with the separatist leaders through a powerful mediatory committee in Balochistan.
 - iii. Private militias must be banned and discouraged all over the country.
 - iv. The issue of missing persons should be resolved in accordance with Article 10-A of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

Conclusion

The above reforms would help in the betterment of Pakistan and would help in improving the implementation of the National Action Plan (NAP).

Second Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

Executive Summary

The National Action Plan was introduced by the Government of Pakistan after the Peshawar Attack due to immense pressure. As a result of this act, certain reforms were introduced. For instance, the 21st amendment was introduced as a result of this plan. Moreover, around 20 committees were also made initially, that would oversee the implementation of this plan. However, due to certain reasons, mostly grounded in the problems that plague Pakistan, including but not limited to, irresponsible journalism this plan was not implemented properly. This report aims to come up with recommendations that will correct the problem of implementation using specific recommendations that will address each of the points mentioned in the National Action Plan.

Background

On 16th December 2014, terrorists entered Army Public School in Peshawar and killed innocent people. After this horrific incident took place, the Civil and the military leadership decided that it was high time they took action. The Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif called an All Parties Conference for the purpose of formulating a counter terrorism strategy at this point. One of the most important developments that came about at this time was that the Prime Minister lifted the moratorium on the death penalty and this paved the way for the introduction and subsequent admission of the 21st amendment.

What was eventually formulated is called the National Action Plan. It has around 20 points that aim to deal with problems such as terrorism, sectarian violence, hate speech, extremist ideology in various ways. In order for effective implementation to take place, the Prime Minister also made quite a few committees to oversee the implementation of this very plan. However,

status quo proves to us that there are several loopholes where this strategy is concerned. For example, these very committees that were made by the Prime Minister, but they only exist on paper. This report will aim to identify those loopholes and will try to suggest alternatives to those issues.

Why was NAP introduced?

The National Action Plan was introduced on December 24 by the Prime Minister through a televised address, when terrorism related activities were considered to be at an all-time high in Pakistan. The Prime Minister established a National Action Committee at the time and all the decisions were taken keeping in mind the recommendations of the committee. The military had launched Operation Zarb-e Azb in response to this threat of terrorism and the attack on Army Public School was a response of the Taliban to the operation. One could say that the National Action Plan was introduced immediately after the Peshawar Attack because there was a lot of pressure on the Prime Minister and the Chief of Army Staff to perform with regards to the threat of terrorism in Pakistan which had then reached a critical point where these terrorists could enter a school in broad daylight and murder hundreds of people. This plan, launched by the State, was meant to be comprehensive in terms of its approach towards catering to the threat of terrorism.

Critical Analysis

The Status of Implementation of the National Action Plan

The National Action Plan has approximately twenty points that try to cater to different problems within the country.

The Table below will summarize the status of implementation of these points:

The statistics quoted above to highlight the progress of the NAP on different spheres have been provided by the

| Sr. # | Point within the National Action Plan | Status of Implementation |
|-------|--|---|
| 1. | Execution of convicted terrorists | At this point, the list of the terrorists has been sent by Federal and the provincial governments to the Courts. Under this point of the plan, 211 executions have taken place as per the Interior Ministry. |
| 2. | Establishment of special courts | Seven trial courts have been established overall. Out of these, 3 were established in Punjab, 2 in Sindh, 1 in Balochistan and 1 in KPK. The Chief of Army recently issued the order that the number of these courts in Sindh will increase. Also, recently the Supreme Court has also given these courts legal cover. 28 cases |

| | | |
|-----|---|--|
| | | have been decided, 46 are under trial. As per the Interior Ministry “ there has been no political pressure and only jet black terrorists have been targeted” |
| 3. | Strengthen and activate NACTA | NACTA coordinator Hamid Ali Khan resigned on 3 rd August, 2015 due to lack of funds, tussle between interior ministry and Prime Minister Secretariat and non-cooperation of security and intelligence agencies. For National Action Plan in budget 2015-16 one billion rupees is allocated from which funds will also be given to NACTA. |
| 4. | Countering hate speech / extremist material | According to a recent report 4,589 cases were registered and 4,266 people arrested for hate-speech |
| 5. | Choke financing of terrorists & terrorists organizations | Anti-Money Laundering Act has been launched to deal with the problem of hawala/hundi |
| 6. | Ensuring against re-emergence of proscribed organizations | A clear and uniform list of banned organizations has been prepared. Several alleged members of these organizations have also been arrested |
| 7. | Establishing and deploying dedicated Counter-Terrorism force? | CTF in Punjab and ATF in Sindh were established. This force roughly constitutes of around 1000 people with the army acting as a Quick Reaction Force in each province |
| 8. | Effective steps against religious persecution | Campaigns have been launched for this purpose. Suspected/ Alleged terrorists are tracked through tracking devices. However, no figures on its progress have been reported by the government yet. |
| 9. | Regulation and Registration of Madrassahs | 26000 madrassahs have been registered and 10000-15000 are yet to be registered. The Government is been trying to introduce some reforms to the madrassas but these have failed to materialize in any substantive efforts due to differences between the government and the madrassa authorities. It needs to also be remembered that the state had reiterated its resolve earlier too in the form of the National Internal Security Policy (NISP), promulgated more than a year ago. Under this, the National Counter Terrorism Authority (NACTA) was mandated to carry out the registration of madrassas. Presumably, the NAP would build upon this but the reality is that NACTA, till date, remains powerless and without resources, an organization on paper. The NAP is silent about the roadmap of these reforms; Without setting out the framework of lucidly thought out madrassa reform, the NAP may just go nowhere as did the NISP regarding these reforms. |
| 10. | Ban on glorification of terrorism and terror organizations in print and electronic media | The Government's policy on the matter is that of zero tolerance. This is being strictly enforced especially through the Code of Conduct 2015, which has replaced the PEMRA 2009 act. It focuses on curtailing any material or hate speech which is against Islamic values or its founding fathers. The main focus of this is to prevent sectarian violence on electronic media. |

| | | |
|-----|--|--|
| 11. | FATA Reforms | <p>The National Action Plan has the point of FATA reforms but there is no as such implementation done until now and the status for FATA is vague.</p> <p>Khyber Siyasi Ittehad, a conglomerate of various political and religious parties in the tribal areas, has rejected the proposed recommendations of Fata Reforms Commission and threatened to hold a sit-in outside Parliament House in Islamabad if these recommendations are not reversed forthwith.</p> <p>The leaders of PPP, PTI, ANP, QWP, JUI-F, JI and National Party along with hundreds of their supporters on Sunday organized a protest rally at the historic Bab-i-Khyber to reject the recommendations put forth by Fata Reforms Commission.</p> |
| 12. | Dismantling communication networks of terrorist networks | SIM verification has taken place already. Around 140 million SIMs were verified and around 11 million were blocked. |
| 13. | Measures against abuse of internet & social media for terrorism | Despite there being a ban, 20/60 terrorist organizations have a presence online. |
| 14. | Zero tolerance of militancy in Punjab | Over 500 cases have been have been sent to jail since NAP was implemented. 968 cases have been sent to the court |
| 15. | Taking Karachi Operation to its logical conclusion | The Operation in Karachi is on-going. Recently, the mandate of Rangers within Karachi has been extended with the permission of the Chief Minister. According to the Interior Minister, 60% to 70 % of reduction in crime |
| 16. | Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists | The laws against propagation of sectarian hatred through misuse of loud speakers of mosques, public meetings etc are being strictly enforced. However, long term planning is needed in this regard. |
| 17. | Policy on Afghan refugees | Recently, a tripartite meeting was held between Afghan, Pakistan and UN and it was demanded of the Pakistani government to extend the status of the refugees for 2 more years. Pakistan has said they will consider this after approval from the federal cabinet. However, it is most likely that this will be accepted and granted. |
| | Revamping and reforming criminal justice system | Police, prosecution and courts are being strengthened in their respective provinces. For instance, in Sindh the IG Sindh is working hard to improve the conditions of the prisons. |

Ministry of Interior. Though these may represent actual progress, it would be better for the government to seek the assistance of civil society organizations and various non-governmental organizations (such as PILDAT) to carry out independent studies in order to represent the true state of affairs in the country. If progress has been found to be unsatisfactory on certain fronts, the government can poise itself to take immediate action.

What are the bodies required to oversee the implementation of the NAP? How many reports of implementation of the NAP have been submitted to those since December 2014?

In order to implement the National Action Plan, apex committees were formulated throughout the countries.

Each province has its own apex committee that oversees the implementation of the national action plan. Ever since it was formed, the apex committee of Sindh has met a number of times and has taken a number of important decisions such as the decision to extend the Karachi Operation. However, it seems to be the case that whenever these apex committees meet and they take a decision, the proceedings of the meetings are not conveyed to the public properly through the media. This seems to be a general problem where the implementation of the National Action Plan is concerned.

Currently a lot of meetings take place between General Raheel Sharif and Prime Minister but they're mostly behind closed doors. Firstly, it is recommended that information through timely press releases must reach the public as it is a confidence building measure. These reports should not be releasing classified information. However, it is the right of the public of Pakistan to know about the proceedings of these committees. Secondly, where the implementation of the National Action Plan is concerned, while ideally Parliament should be the one of institutions that should be overseeing the implementation of the plan, since it consists of the representatives of the people it should be noted that MNAs in the Parliament are bound by party lines, therefore scrutiny will be difficult, especially within the current Parliament since PML-N is the ruling party within the current National Assembly and its leader, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif, who happens to be the one who introduced the National Action Plan is the one overseeing the implementation of this plan

Moreover, since the issue of national security is of great importance, the army, intelligence agencies and relevant ministers should coordinate with each other while overseeing the implementation of this plan. To that end, the National Security Committee, which was introduced by the PML-N in place of the Defence Committee of the Cabinet, should be utilized. This committee comprises of all the relevant officials i.e the Minister of Foreign Affairs, Minister of Defence, Minister of Interior, Minister of Finance, Chairman Joints Chief of Staff Committee and Chiefs of Staff of Pakistan Army, Navy and Air Force. However, in order to ensure that effective implementation of the plan will take place; there should be some reforms especially with regards to its composition. It can be observed that this committee seeks no input from experts on policy making, civil servants or think tank researches. Therefore, in order to attain maximum input from various stakeholders, the NSC should formulate a secondary tier, which should include experts on various relevant issues and civil servants of the highest levels to

complement its highest tier. Since, the National Action Plan covers all aspects of an effective counter terrorism strategy, the secretariat's main focus should be to assist in the organization, proceedings and dissemination of information accordingly, along with the appropriate rules of business.

Another eminent problem with the current National Security Committee is that it has only met three times since its establishment and has published its press releases. Thus, there should be a method of accountability especially where this committee is concerned since it deals with such an important topic i.e. internal security, defence etc. The National Security Division which is in charge of convening this committee should be the one holding these individuals accountable.

Apart from holding regular meetings, the Committee should also focus on the national security agenda with the main focus on a vision which would help it in becoming the cornerstone for guidance of other policies, incorporating defense, foreign and economic policies.

How do other Countries Monitor Implementation of similar National Security Strategies?

The Committee would like to shed light on the internal security apparatus set up in various countries to develop a comparative analysis with that of Pakistan.

Since the Parliamentary setup has been imported from the United Kingdom, it would be prudent that the setup in UK is analyzed. A National Security Committee (NSC) has been set up which includes Secretaries of various ministries, the Prime Minister and the Deputy Prime Minister, with the Chiefs of Armed forces called upon when required. The role of the secretariat is executed by the National Security Advisor who has a team of researchers for assistance. The NSC is responsible for considering internal and national security on all fronts; nuclear, emerging threats, restricted groups and the like.

Given the level of similarity we share with India on many fronts, the committee would also like to draw on the example of the National Security Council (NSC) set up in India. This is a three-tiered setup, with the top level consisting of the Prime Minister and Specific Ministers, the second tier consisting of the Chiefs of the Armed Forces and specific secretaries. The third level consists of specialists from think tanks who have an expertise in defence, foreign and military affairs and other such related areas.

Two conclusions can be drawn from these examples. Firstly, the governments have sought the expertise and advice of those outside the parliament, with the inclusion of civil servants in UK (and researchers working underneath them) and appointment of think tank analysts in India. Secondly, both of them have refrained from placement of the armed forces chiefs at the same hierarchical level as the parliament members selected at the highest levels.

What is the Role of Media in the Implementation of the National Action Plan?

The role of the media is extremely important where the National Action Plan is concerned. It is the job of the media to disseminate the information that is released by the committees. At the moment the perception that is portrayed by the media, is to an extent skewed, while realistically speaking it is close to impossible for the media to be completely unbiased, it is however possible for the media to focus on the facts and to not sensationalize the stories so that an objective critique can take place. Keeping in mind that the media has a vital role when it comes to relaying the information to the public, therefore PEMRA should create a code of conduct specifically with regards to the coverage of terrorism on television so that irresponsible journalism does not take place.

Other Recommendations and their Rationale

- i. The safeguards that are available to the persons found guilty through these Courts including but not limited to the option of appealing in the Supreme Court should be highlighted in the media or through press releases so that the general public is aware of these safeguards.
- ii. An electronic database of proven terrorists needs to be maintained by the relevant authorities through coordination so that the process of catching these terrorists can be facilitated.
- iii. Joint training of civil law enforcement agencies with the army for instance the Special Branch of the Police should take place so that the militancy situation throughout the country, especially in the cities where the army can't step in, is controlled effectively.
- iv. Coordination between military and civilian agencies should be ensured so that the internal security policy can be strengthened. There should be a separate part of the defence budget that is allocated for this purpose
- v. A comprehensive definition of "hate speech" and "armed militias" that is acceptable to all the institutions ideally should be formulated by the Parliament.
- vi. Better relations must be built with the people of Balochistan, by focusing on the economic development of Balochistan and minimizing the role of FC since the negative perception of the State and the Army has led to a large chunk of the problems.
- vii. It is noted that approximately one billion has been allocated to the National Action Plan within the current budget, it is recommended that the Parliament should keep a check on this especially with regards to expenditure allocated to defence, inland security etc.
- viii. Increased coordination through the apex committee should be ensured in all the provinces so that it is easier to implement the plan.
- ix. At the end of the 2 year period of the military courts, a report should be produced by a panel of experts, to evaluate whether they have been useful or not. Only if they are deemed as effective, a constitutional amendment should come about.
- x. As a long-term strategy, the curriculum in public schools and private schools should be revised to promote feelings of tolerance and the concept of citizenship should be taught to the youth. Moreover, the madrassah curriculum should be revised to ensure that the graduates have practical skills.
- xi. To cater to the problem of the funding of madrassahs by terrorist organizations, a sufficient part of the budget should be given to these madrassahs and their curriculum should be monitored.
- xii. The establishment of the 20 committees should be reviewed by the Parliament and if they are deemed as ineffective, they should be formally resolved.
- xiii. Formal channels of Civil Military cooperation should be emphasized upon and encouraged to ensure that the public is aware of the proceedings that take place during the meetings. Press releases should be a priority of these committees so that the public is aware of the decisions taken place by these committees
- xiv. NACTA should work on streamlining the flow of information from various agencies in Pakistan to assist Armed Forces especially Police in Intelligence Based Operations
- xv. Law enforcement agencies should monitor the publicity channels of armed militia to weaken their support.
- xvi. The process of registration of madrassahs should be a priority so that the curriculum can be regulated eventually
- xvii. In order to deal with the issues in FATA, it is recommended that Frontier Crimes Regulation should be abolished and a constitutional

amendment (Article 147) should come about which give the Supreme Court the jurisdiction in FATA. It is noted that this may not pass in the National Assembly, however this is vital to solving the problems of FATA

Note: The progress of the soft aspect of the National Action Plan, i.e, those aspects which do not involve direct action, rather building on a national consensus and narrative has to be acted upon strongly and to be reported to the general public. This will not only serve as a confidence building measure between the state and the public, but also help to show that concrete work is being carried out by the state on establishing a counter-narrative to combat the intolerant mind-set prevailing in our society.

Third Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

Executive Summary

The Committee of National Security and Foreign Affairs was assigned the task to recommend the policies required to better implement National Action Plan (NAP). Our recommendations are basically set on the parameter of longevity of the policies in order to curb the menace of terrorism and other extremist tendencies once and for all.

Parliament should be respected and be given superiority on every decision after thorough and critical debates in the house. Civilian administration is favored over military courts and administration in the longer run. However, it should be kept in mind that the coordination of the civilian establishment, military establishment, intelligence agencies and committees formed to oversee NAP progress and implementation.

The National Action Plan is a critical yet commendable effort, but it certainly needs comprehension of policies and their implementation. It should be ensured that the implementation of the National Action Plan is an ongoing process and its enforcement is also ensured. Continuity of plan is also one most important aspect. At the present the people have acquired awareness and they are eager to know more and they do not seem to agree on the delay of anything that could affect the society and nation at large. National narrative needs to be worked on.

The progress of the soft aspect of the National Action Plan, i.e., those aspects which do not involve direct action, rather building on a national consensus and narrative has to be acted upon strongly and to be reported to the general public. This will not only serve as a confidence building measure between the state and the public, but also help to show that concrete work is being carried out by the state on establishing a counter-narrative to combat the intolerant mind-set prevailing in our society. Moreover, the National Action Plan is in its initial phase and lots have to be improved in this regard. For its effective implementation its continuity has to be ensured.

Background

On 16th December 2014, terrorists entered Army Public School in Peshawar and killed innocent children. After this horrific incident took place, the Civil and the military leadership decided that it was high time they took action. The Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif called an All Parties Conference for the purpose of formulating a counter terrorism strategy at this point.

One of the most important developments that came about at this time was that the Prime Minister lifted the moratorium on the death penalty and this paved the way for the introduction and subsequent admission of the 21st Amendment.

What was eventually formulated is called the National Action Plan. It has around 20 points that aim to deal with problems such as terrorism, sectarian violence, hate speech, extremist ideology in various ways. In order for effective implementation to take place, the Prime Minister also made quite a few committees to oversee the implementation of this very plan. However, status quo proves to us that there are several loopholes where this strategy is concerned. For example, there is a delay in the functioning of the committees that were made by the Prime Minister. This report will aim to identify those loopholes and will try to suggest alternatives to those issues.

NATIONAL ACTION PLAN (NAP); December 2014

The twenty points of NAP are:

- i. Execution of convicted terrorists
- ii. Establishment of special trial courts
- iii. Ensure no armed militias are allowed to function in the country
- iv. Strengthening and activation of NACTA
- v. Countering hate speech and extremist material
- vi. Choking financing for terrorists and terrorist organizations
- vii. Ensuring against re-emergence of proscribed organizations
- viii. Establishing and deploying a dedicated counter-terrorism force
- ix. Taking effective steps against religious persecution
- x. Registration and regulation of madrassas
- xi. Ban on glorification of terrorism and terrorist organizations through print and electronic media
- xii. FATA Reforms
- xiii. Dismantling communication networks of terrorist organizations
- xiv. Measures against abuse of internet and social media for terrorism
- xv. Zero tolerance for militancy in Punjab
- xvi. Taking the ongoing operation in Karachi to its logical conclusion
- xvii. Baluchistan reconciliation
- xviii. Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists
- xix. Policy to deal with the issue of Afghan refugees
- xx. Revamping and reforming the criminal justice system

National Action Plan; Status of Implementation

Implementation of NAP requires national unity. It came as a result of the most dreadful crises. According to Interior Ministry 211 executions have taken place. However, one in 10 of the 226 prisoners executed since December was convicted of a terror attack, according to human rights activists. As of 10th February the Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan was informed that for combing purposes 16344 operations had been conducted in which 218220 persons were picked up. Out them, 12462 persons were arrested whereas 140 of them had terrorist links. It was informed that 3265 cases of misuse of loudspeakers had been registered with 2065 arrests and 1281 confiscation of equipment. As many as 547 cases had been registered with regard to hate speeches and material.

In addition to the military courts, the Government has decided to increase both the scope and number of special courts formed under the Protection of Pakistan Act (PPA) 2014 for the swift trial of all those who are 'enemies of the state' and disrupt peace. To choke terror financing in Pakistan under the National Action Plan (NAP), details of the bank accounts of over 5,000 terror suspects placed in the list of 4th Schedule of Anti-Terrorism Act (ATA) 1997 will be monitored. These hostile entities should know that corruption is the essence of terrorism. Hence, people want that this menace must be eliminated from the country as part of overall war against terrorism. In this context, on June 10, 2015, while showing the progress of the Zarb-e-Azb, Chief of Army Staff, Gen. Raheel Sharif said, "Terrorists have been cleared from their strongholds in North Waziristan and Khyber Agency and fight now is moving into last few pockets close to Afghan border." He laid emphasis on "continuation of the operations till elimination of the last expected and probable terrorists groups and sanctuaries." In the functioning of NACTA the most important element of its funding and its rightful usage is the core issue still to be addressed properly.

According to a recent report 4,589 cases were registered and 4,266 people arrested for hate speech. Admitting slow progress in some key areas of the National Action Plan (NAP) against terrorism, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif has ordered swift legislation to purge the country of illegal weapons. "I want the whole country to be de-weaponised," he told his cabinet colleagues during the apex committee's meeting held at his office on Thursday.

There is slow yet useful implementation of the NAP. However, there are some loopholes that need to be addressed critically and to be resolved using practical

and long-term policies.

Bodies Responsible for Implementation of NAP

- i. Apex Committees (Federal and Provincial)
- ii. National Security Committee (NSC)
- iii. National Counter Terrorism Authority (NACTA)

Parliament must oversee the implementation of the National Action Plan. Reason being; Parliament is the sovereign entity of the state of Pakistan with representation of members from all the parties and provinces. Anything that needs to be discussed could be done in the Parliament with ease and instant suggestions and recommendations by the parliamentarians. The other bodies within the parliament are also important to oversee the progress and along with that there is also a need of other institutions to focus and streamline the agendas after thorough discussions followed by recommendations and ultimately effective implementation.

Policy Recommendations with Rationale

Parliament should remain supreme and a place where legislation is made regarding counterterrorism. Any laws regarding terrorism should be sufficiently debated within the Parliament. Civilian administration should not hand over its responsibilities to the military in the longer run. Rather it should work on enhancing its capacity. It should improve police force and its training and should augment internal intelligence agencies. Joint training of civil law enforcement agencies with the army for instance the Special Branch of the Police should take place so that the militancy situation throughout the country, especially in the cities where the army can't step in, is controlled effectively.

The tenure of military courts should not be extended beyond two years. Rather Pakistan's criminal and legal system should be revamped that makes use of latest technology to collect evidence and offers fair trial to the alleged, and gives protection to the witness. Train the law enforcement agencies to target the sleeper cells of armed militias and gangs.

An electronic database of proven terrorists needs to be maintained by the relevant authorities through coordination so that the process of catching these terrorists can be facilitated. However, execution of terrorist is not a long term strategy; as a terrorist does not fear death, and due to this many others might turn into a terrorist as a revenge of the execution of their fellow

There is a need to define what is actually a 'hate material' On the basis of that, as a long term strategy, the

curriculum in public schools and private schools should be revised to promote feelings of tolerance and the concept of citizenship should be taught to the youth. Moreover, the registration of the Madrassahs should be first in priority so that curriculum should be revised and regulated eventually. In this way hate speech could be abolished and hence religious persecution could also be eliminated.

We have different issues in several parts of Pakistan, which are under different context and should be dealt under specific measures. Better relations must be built with the people of Balochistan, by focusing on the economic development of Balochistan. There is also a concern of the Baloch people that they feel terrorized and always under state of 'curfew' due to the vast presence of military people patrolling in their area as if something disastrous is about. It is suggested on their behalf that such patrolling should be avoided in order to build confidence in the general public of Balochistan. It was also recommended to ensure the coverage of the issues in Balochistan through citizen journalism as most of the times while making any policy the reports/evidence is not there that could be kept in mind in order to suggest any policy or reform. IDPs should be timely resettled and rehabilitated. An option of considering FATA as part of KP is also recommended. Militancy in Punjab to be eliminated and the present rangers operation should not be discouraged as whole. However, local police training should be ensured in order to have continuity and success in the countering terrorism efforts both in short and long terms.

We need to introduce a specialized communication interception method in order to dismantle the communication networks of the terrorist organization. A specialized 'response unit' is also needed in communication strategy, in case any message got delivered specially via social media an instant response could be ensured by responding to that message and avoid chaos, terror and disturbance in the society.

Citizen should be given first aid training and also be trained about the actions they could take when a terrorist attack takes place. There should be a revival of NCA in schools, colleges and universities with special focus on self defense and counter-terrorism.

The issue of Afghan refugees in the country is been analyzed in the humanitarian aspect and the committee believes that their monitored registrations should be made. And the (if) decision of sending them back to Afghanistan, must be made politically by both concerned countries and settle this issue by giving the people their full dignity.

To choke the funding of the terrorists commendable efforts has already been started by FIA in association with the State Bank of Pakistan. However, we should keep in mind that most of the funding is reported to be coming from external sources and that should also be addressed properly.

The world is globalised and technology has offered many solutions for issues we face. An application should be introduced with the aims of letting people report hate speech or extremism, updating civilians on the status on the anti-terrorism achievements. Serving as a medium for spreading the message of peace and tolerance among. This could be the direct form of communication between state and civilian. Through active involvement in the reporting and updates through this method of perception management, civilians trust on the state could be gained.

Normative Analysis/Comparison with other Countries

The Committee would like to shed light on the internal security apparatus set up in various countries to develop a comparative analysis with that of Pakistan. Since the parliamentary setup has been imported from the United Kingdom, it would be prudent that the setup in UK is analyzed. A National Security Committee (NSC) has been set up which includes Secretaries of various ministries, the Prime Minister and the Deputy Prime Minister, with the Chiefs of Armed forces called upon when required. The role of the secretariat is executed by the National Security Advisor who has a team of researchers for assistance. The NSC is responsible for considering internal and national security on all fronts; nuclear, emerging threats, restricted groups and the like.

Given the level of similarity we share with India on many fronts, the committee would also like to draw on the example of the National Security Council (NSC) set up in India. This is a three-tiered setup, with the top level consisting of the Prime Minister and Specific Ministers, the second tier consisting of the Chiefs of the Armed Forces and specific secretaries. The third level consists of specialists from think tanks who have an expertise in defence, foreign and military affairs and other such related areas.

Conclusions drawn from both models: Inclusion of research by individual experts, think tanks output, academic opinion and field expert is recommended. Secondly, both of them have refrained from placement of the armed forces chiefs at the same hierarchal level as the parliament members selected at the highest levels.

Fourth Session Report; 7th Youth Parliament Pakistan

Abstract

The Government of Pakistan (GOP) introduced the National Action Plan (NAP) after the APS attack in Peshawar. The plan proposed comprehensive reforms consisting of twenty (20) points for addressing the scourge of terrorism including passing the 21st constitutional amendment. The NAP also involved formation of committees to oversee its implementation. The purpose of this report is to analyse the stages of implementation of NAP and makes comparison with plan of other countries. In conclusion steps have been recommended in order to make this plan more effective.

Introduction

The Primary responsibility of a state is to protect the life, liberty and property of its citizens. On 16th December 2015, 149 innocent Pakistani's including 132 school children were brutally massacred in the APS attack. The tragedy shook the whole society and led to the civil military leadership to join hands for a decisive

response i.e. National Action Plan (NAP) consisting of twenty (20) points; addressing direct violence, structural and cultural violence in the country.

Basic Problems of Implementation

The Civil-Military trust deficit: the non-functional status of NACTA is one example.

- i. Lack of cooperation from Provincial Government.
- ii. Constitutional and Legislative issues.

Bodies required to over seeing the implementation of the NAP

NAP is multifaceted plan that requires close coordination between civil and political institutions for its effective implementation. For this purpose both at federal and provincial levels an Apex Committee, comprising of both Civil and military officials of highest levels, has been devised to oversee the progress and implementation of National Action Plan.

Should Parliament be one of the institutions overseeing the implementation of the NAP? If yes, what would be the most appropriate bodies within the Parliament of Pakistan to do so?

| Sr. # | NAP | Status of Implementation | Committee's Recommendations | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------|-----------------------------------|---|--|---------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|----------|---|----|---|--------|---|----|---|-------|---|----|---|-------------|---|----|----|-----|---|-----|----|--|
| 1 | Execution of convicted terrorists | Since the lifting of the moratorium on executions, around 200 including 50 terrorists hanged. | Instead of selective executions, across the board enforcement recommended i.e. <i>Mumtaz Qadri/Omar Sheikh</i> | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Establishment of special courts | <p>Military courts established across the country to try terrorists.</p> <p>Cases deemed appropriate by the MOI (Interior ministry) are referred to the military courts.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Location</th> <th>No. of Courts</th> <th>Cases referred to MOI</th> <th>Cases referred to Military Courts</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>ICT & GB</td> <td>0</td> <td>12</td> <td>5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Punjab</td> <td>3</td> <td>55</td> <td>8</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Sindh</td> <td>3</td> <td>74</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Balochistan</td> <td>1</td> <td>20</td> <td>58</td> </tr> <tr> <td>K.P</td> <td>3</td> <td>423</td> <td>10</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | Location | No. of Courts | Cases referred to MOI | Cases referred to Military Courts | ICT & GB | 0 | 12 | 5 | Punjab | 3 | 55 | 8 | Sindh | 3 | 74 | 3 | Balochistan | 1 | 20 | 58 | K.P | 3 | 423 | 10 | <p>The decision of the military court must be made public.</p> <p>Provide a Right to Appeal to the President.</p> <p>Right to counsel for the accused.</p> |
| Location | No. of Courts | Cases referred to MOI | Cases referred to Military Courts | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ICT & GB | 0 | 12 | 5 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Punjab | 3 | 55 | 8 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Sindh | 3 | 74 | 3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Balochistan | 1 | 20 | 58 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| K.P | 3 | 423 | 10 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | Ban armed Militias | Operation Zarb-e-Azb and Khyber One has been launched against the terrorists. 2763 terrorists have been killed. 837 hideouts have been destroyed. 253 tonnes of explosives recovered. 203 actionable calls have been received. 2237 intelligence-based operations were caused across the country. 24844 combing operations have been conducted. | <p>Strict action should be taken against all armed militants within the country.</p> <p>Weapon licensing and weapon sale within the country should be strictly monitored.</p> <p>Right to counsel for the accused.</p> | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | | | |
|---|--|---|---|
| 4 | Strengthen/Activate NACTA | Lacks basic staffing. No funds allocated. | NACTA should be implemented along with complete staff including an autonomous Chief. National Internal Security Policy (NISP) should be implemented through the platform of NACTA. Funds be made available for an immediate functioning of the plan. For Intelligence co-operation Joint Intelligence Directorate (JID) be established for all security and intelligence agencies coordination under the supervision of NACTA. |
| 5 | Countering Hate Speech / Extremist Material | 4,589 cases registered including 4,266 people for hate-speech. The Punjab Sound System (Regulation) Ordinance 2015, under which 2874 arrested in Punjab. An anti-hate speech campaign launched in 45 district of Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) titled “ <i>Bolo Zimadari Se</i> ” aimed at creating public awareness through the SMS on the negative impacts of hate speech. | Ensure national curriculum is free from biases and prejudices. Hold publishing houses accountable. |
| 6 | Choke financing of terrorists & terrorists organizations | MOI policy regarding the financing of NGOs /INGO’s implemented. Regulation of spending/funding of charity organizations initiated. | Ensure complete ban on extortions and underground financing. Improve Law & order. |
| 7 | Ensuring against re-emergence of proscribed organizations | No concrete steps taken so far. Lack of coordination between federal and provincial government on implementation. 60 banned outfits are still openly working under different names and have even contested local government elections. | Banned organisations be registered along with their complete list of leadership to ensure check that these members do not re-emerge under different names. |
| 8 | Establishing and deploying dedicated Counter-Terrorism force | Antiterrorism forces have been enacted in Punjab and Sindh whereas the same is already active in KP since Musharraf era. They are performing their duties diligently and army is acting as a quick reaction force. | |
| 9 | Taking effective steps against religious persecution | There is no tangible implementation. | The blasphemy law should be reformed i.e. 295 (C) |

| | | | |
|----|--|---|--|
| 10 | Regulation/Registration of Madrassahs | <p>An estimated 50,000 seminaries operating 22,052 registered.</p> <p>446 unregistered madrassas in Islamabad and 187 are registered.</p> <p>Steps taken to formulate Islamic Education Commission to regulate their textbooks.</p> <p>Provinces not effectively implementing it.</p> | <p>Provinces should ensure effective implementation by upgrading their capacity.</p> <p>Long-term steps should be taken to reconcile madrassahs with mainstream education system.</p> |
| 11 | Ban on glorification of terrorism and terror organizations in print and electronic media | <p>Act has been passed but its implementation is lacking.</p> | <p>PEMRA should be empowered to take action.</p> |
| 12 | FATA Reforms | <p>A national debate has been initiated for FATA reforms for integrating it under the constitutional ambit.</p> | <p>Peace in FATA should be guaranteed by;</p> <p>Strengthening LEVIS force for security, equipping and training 500 Levies per agency and 200 per frontier region,</p> <p>Create coordination cell under FATA law and order committees,</p> <p>Article 247 of the Constitution should be amended to guarantee fundamental rights for all tribal litigation and shift primary legislative powers to the parliament</p> <p>FCR rules should be abolished.</p> <p>Local body elections should be held in FATA.</p> <p>A comprehensive package should be developed for FATA and infrastructural development initiated with special focus on health, education and employment.</p> <p>The future status of FATA should be decided by its people as to whether it should be a separate province or amalgamated into KP.</p> <p>PEMRA jurisdiction should be extended and tribal citizens should be</p> |

| | | | |
|----|---|---|---|
| | | | <p>provided with opportunities for media interaction and participation.</p> <p>The JIRGA system should either be abolished or be more democratized.</p> <p>Executive and judicial powers should be separated in FATA.</p> <p>Property inheritance laws should be implemented to safeguard the properties of the citizens.</p> <p>Civil armed forces should be strengthened and professionalized</p> |
| 13 | Dismantling communication networks of terrorist networks | Out of 103 Million active SIMs, 75.5 Million SIMs have been re-verified using biometric while 27.5 Million active SIMs have been blocked as of 15th May 2015. | Ensure complete verification of SIM. |
| 14 | Measures against abuse of internet and social media for terrorism | PECB bill introduced. | Cybercrime should be addressed however blanket ban on social media for citizens should be avoided. |
| 15 | Zero tolerance of militancy in Punjab | 26,000 cases were registered in Punjab during the first six months of 2015. Courts decided 12% of these cases. | Stricter action should be taken that all terrorist networks are annihilated in Punjab. |
| 16 | Taking Karachi Operation to its logical conclusion | Largely successful Karachi operation has improved law & order. Some of the political parties have shown reservations over implementation. | <p>The largely successful operation of Karachi can be strengthened via the following recommendations;</p> <p>A commission comprising of members of judiciary and parliamentarians should be made to overlook the Karachi operation especially to address the grievances.</p> <p>Extra judicial killing, illegal detainment and inhumane torture during interrogation should be stopped.</p> <p>The powers of the military should be clearly outlined to avoid any controversy surrounding the operation.</p> <p>The police should be given an</p> |

| | | | |
|----|---|---|---|
| | | | <p>effective training so that they may be able to overtake efficiently once the military operation is over.</p> |
| 17 | Balochistan Reconciliation | Reconciliation steps initiated including opening dialogue with disgruntled Baloch leaders. | <p>Time period should be assigned for the recovery of missing persons of Balochistan.</p> <p>A Grand Jirga/committee from all walks of Balochistan /tribal chief/ civil society for dialogue with disgruntled Baloch leaders should be formed that can ensure tight vigilance over any extra judicial measures and outstanding royalties from gas and minerals.</p> |
| 18 | Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists | Crackdown on sectarian elements started including initiatives by MOI to ban calling of other sects as infidels. | <p>Hate literature promoting sectarianism should be strictly banned.</p> <p>Authors and publishers of hate literature should be punished accordingly.</p> <p>PEMRA should take strict legal action against any media group that is opposing any specific sect in the country.</p> <p>A neutral platform should be provided to address the misunderstanding among different sects to avoid sectarian violence.</p> |
| 19 | Policy on Afghan refugees | Steps taken to repatriate the Afghan Refugees of which 137,000 Afghan Refugees have exited Pakistan by July 2015. | Ensure completion of the repatriation. |
| 20 | Revamping and reforming Criminal Justice System (CJS) | No implementation so far in light of NAP. | <p>Amend the Criminal Procedure Code (CPC) to establish a robust witness protection program, and make the protection of witnesses, investigators, prosecutors and judges a priority. Amend the Evidence Act to require investigators to incorporate scientific methods and data in investigations Prevent external influence in investigations by requiring the approval of the relevant public safety commission before an investigating officer in an on-going investigation can be replaced; Police be given training, resources and compensation, to avoid corruption,</p> |

| | | | |
|--|--|--|---|
| | | | <p>succumb to bribery and operate inefficiently, at most levels Support enhancement of counter-terrorism capacity including training investigators in forensics.</p> <p>Providing security of tenure to prosecutors, empowering them to reject weak cases, as well as specialised training in such fields as homicide and counter-terrorism. Police should not be burdened with other duties like VIP security.</p> |
|--|--|--|---|

While Apex committee is assessing the status of implementation of NAP, there is a need for purely civilian institute to monitor and oversee the manner in which NAP is being implemented. For this Parliament is the ideal forum.

In order to ensure NAP is implemented in proper manner, the implementation should be based on two tier structure; first being the Apex Committee, which comprise of both civilian and military officials and the second tier should be the Joint parliamentary committee to Monitor Implementation of NAP.

While the first tier assesses the operational success of NAP, challenges and ways of improving it, the purpose of second tier (committee) should be to monitor the way NAP is being implemented. To retain the effectiveness of NAP the committee should not have any say in formulating operational strategy of NAP but should only be concerned with its operational execution to safeguard against the extra judicial measures.

Role of media and the Citizens

Media is the fourth pillar of the state. It enjoys the soft power to influence people's hearts and mind and form Public opinion. Media should play a very vigilant and responsible role. It should keep the public up-to-date about the implementation process of the NAP, including its setbacks, problems and stories of success regarding the plan. On the other hand it should not get into the race of "Breaking News" and should not part any information before verifying it from responsible sources. It should abide by the PEMRA laws and should act as a watchdog.

Citizens also have to play a very vigilant and responsible role. They should help government in implementation of NAP by playing their part, then be it providing information or tips on hotlines established by governments or the submission of tenants' information to police stations.

The India and UK Models

Pakistan's geo-strategic and domestic political

compulsions are very different from that of India and UK. While both India and UK enjoy healthy Civil and Military relationships, in case of Pakistan, this is a luxury Pakistan doesn't enjoy. It makes the monitoring of implementation of NAP difficult than that of the two countries, however Pakistan can still learn from both India and UK. The Apex Committee is similar to that of India's National Security Council but the later also have the related Think Tanks and researchers to keep the governments abreast with the changing situations. It is very dynamic and meets regularly. Pakistan's Apex committee should also be similarly vigilant and should incorporate the related Think tanks and it should also meet regularly.

Similarly, the UK's National Security Secretariat (NSS) could be an example how Pakistan can not only Monitor the implementation of NAP in short term but also in the long term it can diversify the scope of the NACTA in similar lines to that of NSS; which include both the external and internal security threats and range from hard weapons to cybercrimes.

The best way of implementation and monitoring of NAP is through NACTA. In order to make it functional both Civil and Military leadership has to undertake Confidence Building Measures (CBMs).

Conclusion

According to the latest report there has been a decline in terrorism in Pakistan vis a vis a dedicated NAP plan to counter extremism and terrorism however steps taken to ensure that by emphasizing on speedier delivery, the NAP should not fail to address critical weaknesses in the judiciary, including the criminal justice system. An already low conviction rate could decline even further.

The success of NAP depends largely on execution of each and every single point envisaged in the plan hence the failure to implement a single point could result in failure of the entire scheme in short and long term.

It is imperative to note that the way the NAP is implemented from the first to the last point would decide what Pakistan would be in the next twenty years.



Secretariat, Youth Parliament Pakistan

Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan

Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan

E-mail: info@youthparliament.pk | Website: www.youthparliament.pk